AN EVALUATION OF DISABILITY-ORIENTED HEALTH EXPENDITURES

Nezihe Tüfekçi¹
Suleyman Demirel University

Hakan Değerli¹
Suleyman Demirel University

Abstract

The social state is defined as a state model that intervenes in the social space in order to develop the citizens, especially people who are in need and disadvantaged in the society, by protecting their social rights (Seyyar, 2008: 422). The social policies on disability, one of the groups that have difficulties in handling their lives as compared to other people, are important in achieving the aims of the social state. Kayalıdere and Şahin (2014: 57) states that one of the tools the social state uses to achieve its goal is social protection expenditures. The aim of this study is to address health expenditures for disabilities. For this purpose, firstly the concept of social state and in this context social policy are discussed. Following this conceptual introduction, health expenditures for disabilities were evaluated.

Keywords
Welfare State, Social Policy, Health Expenditure, The Disabled

1. Correspondence to: Nezihe Tüfekçi Healthcare Management Department, nezihetufekci@gmail.com
2. Healthcare Management Department, hhakandegerli@gmail.com

**Introduction**

The social state, defined as the understanding of the state, which is interested in the social situation of the citizens and provides them with a minimum level of life (Soysal, 1986: 224), has increased in importance in today's developing and changing world. With a number of policies aimed at providing a minimum level of living for the citizens of the State it is possible. For this purpose, social policies bring solutions for inequalities within society. In this context, it is a social responsibility to improve the living standards of disabled groups because disabled people are not a separate segment of the society. It should not be forgotten that they are also a part of our society. It is a human responsibility to make various arrangements to increase and improve the effectiveness of these individuals in the social field, and a basic right in terms of an individual with disabilities. Social policies that protect the disadvantaged people through the understanding of social justice are also important in meeting the health needs as well as in all areas of life for the disabled. This study examined pensions paid in the context of health spending for disabilities and social protection benefits. A general evaluation was made in this aspect.

**Social State Approach**

The social state was first used in Germany in the second half of the 19th century with measures taken regarding social security (Koray, 2008: 95) and continued to develop throughout the 20th century (Kayalidere & Şahin, 2014: 60). The social states concept known in Turkish as “sosyal devlet, refah devleti” or “sosyal refah devleti” are expressed in English as “welfare state” and "sozialstaat" (social state) in German (Kara, 2013: 2). When considering the meaning of the social state concept, there are various definitions made. The social state is a model of the state that requires the state to intervene in order to raise public prosperity (Yay, 2014: 147). Seyyar (2008: 422), states that the welfare state is concerned with the social situation of its citizens, in the form of a state model aiming at providing them with a level of life, social justice and real equality, and protecting them from hardships. A more inclusive definition of the social state is defined by Özbudun (2013: 44) as an understanding of the state that the social and economic life actively intervened by the state is legal and necessary to provide social peace and social justice. It is a state based on the principle of social justice that needs to be understood from the concept of the social state and protects the disadvantaged from the economic-social point of view (Tanor and Yüzbaşıoğlu, 2012: 103). Social state approach: (Aktan, 1995: 73-74)

- A positive state approach in terms of ensuring individual’s rights and freedom.
- It is an interventional state approach.
- It is a regulatory state approach.
- It is a redistributational state approach.
- It is an entrepreneurial state approach.

From these definitions, it can be said that the social state approach is based on the benefit of all the groups in society in an equal manner. It is inevitable that the social state, which has the concept of protection of the weak power, moves with a fair understanding in this point. Justice, defined as granting of rights to everyone (Özgüven, 2003: 36), is considered to be a requirement for the social state considering that the social state's main purpose in its policies is to provide social justice (Sunal, 2011: 284).

Unlike the emergence of the social state approach in the world, in Turkey, it is a process that has been revealed by the government (Yay, 2014: 151). In the second article of the 1961 Constitution which adopted the social state principle for the first time in the history of the Turkish constitution (Resmi Gazette, 1961), the social state principle took place as one of the qualifications for the republic. In the 1970s, the economic crisis in the world economy and the September 12, 1980 Military Operation deeply affected Turkey. The welfare state that started...
to develop with the influence of these events was also negatively affected. For these reasons, in the post-1980 welfare state entered the remodeling process in Turkey (Yay, 2014: 157-158). The second article of the 1982 constitution also stated that the state is a social state. It also emphasized in article 5 that the purpose and tasks of the state should be to remove the political, economic and social obstacles that limit the fundamental rights and freedoms of the people and to provide the necessary conditions for the development of the material and spiritual existence of the people (Resmi Gazette, 1982). Ören (2015: 9) listed some criteria for being a social state: A social state:

- Improves the social life situations of those who are disadvantaged in society with their economic, social and physical aspects.
- Without discrimination, it ensures the welfare, income distribution, social justice and social security of all its citizens.
- It is unavoidable for the state to be in an interventionist position for the formation and understanding of the social state.
- The social state protects the weak, disadvantaged, and all those in need, and prevents the weak from being crushed.
- It takes active roles in all kinds of disability-oriented areas such as education, improvement and employment.
- In legal terms, it is equally distant from all sections and does not discriminate between its citizens.

The criteria listed above refer in some way to "the most appropriate state and the best state". From here it is pointed out that an understanding of the ideal state, is based on the rule of law, advocating for the rights and freedom of individuals, and a state understanding of responsibility for their life and property safety. An ideal state is a state approach that protects orphaned children, elderly people, mentally ill, and disabled people among their constituent citizens (Aktan, 1995: 148).

**Social Policy**

Policy is defined literally as the whole of the principles of organizing and realizing the actions of the state in terms of purpose, method and content (Türk Dil Kurumu Sözlüğü, 2017). In simple terms, policy is a problem-solving method (Ören, 2015: 20). Accepted uses of the concept of social policy are "social policy" in continental Europe and "social welfare policy" in North America (Ersöz, 2003: 144). Sometimes in the literature they use concepts such as "Social Politics; Social Policy; Political Politics; Welfare Policy" (Ören, 2015: 21). Social policy emerged in Germany for the first time in order to protect workers and prevent them from problems such as industrial accidents, illnesses, unemployment and old age that emerged as a result of industrialization and urbanization (Koray, 2008: 33). For this reason, in the first instance and in the narrowest sense, social policy can be seen as a policy that deals with workers’ problems. With the influence of the economic developments experienced in the West after World War II, social policy revealed its most advanced and modern applications during this period (Özaydın, 2008: 164). In its original form, social policy aims to solve social problems that arise between a certain segment of the society and to ensure and widen social welfare. In the meantime, it has become the aim to remove the inequalities among all the individuals in the society. In other words, besides the working life, it has become regulatory and remedial policies for social life (Şenkal, 2011: 26). One of the social policy's scientific pioneers in Turkey Gerhard Kessler defined social policy as, "politics that aim to uphold and maintain the state and legal order in the face of the movements, contradictions and challenges of the social classes". (Kessler, 1948: 12; qtd. in Özaydın, 2008: 165).

It is imperative for the state to provide minimum living standards for the citizens living in the society and to fulfill the services that can not be left to the free market mechanism (Bozkir Serdar, 2011: 4). Arrangements for social life in addition to the economic aspects of the social policy of the Republic of Turkey has shown itself in the
Development Plan (DPT, 1963: 47; DPT, 1968: 2; DPT, 1973: 119; DPT, 1985: 1; DPT, 1990: 1; DPT, 1996: 1; DPT, 2001: 25; DPT, 2007: 3; DPT, 2013: 42-43). It is seen that the only function of the social policy that does not change at any time is preserving the socioeconomic balance between individuals and groups (Şenkal, 2011: 43).

Disability-Oriented Health Expenditures

Individuals may be in a more disadvantaged position in communities where they live because of various reasons. The reasons leading to this situation might have originated from sociocultural factors (color, ethnicity, religion, sexual identity, etc.), or from the deficiencies in the abilities of the individuals (Altan, 2006: 247). Disadvantaged groups in society vary widely from country to country, with the inclusion of women, people with disabilities, unemployed people, prisoners, immigrants/refugees/asylum seekers, homeless people, racial/ethnic minorities and children (Aba and Ates, 2015: 37-41).

The concepts of "disabled", "handicapped" and "crippled", which are used interchangeably in spoken language and written language, contain some differences as content (Şişman et al., 2011: 1). Within the scope of Article 3 of the Law No. 5378 on Disability, the disabled is defined as, "Individuals affected by attitudes and environmental conditions that limits their full and effective participation in equal conditions with other individuals in the society because of their abilities at various levels in their physical, mental, emotional and sensory capabilities” (Resmi Gazette, 2005). Within the scope of Regulation on Disability Criterion, Classification and Reports of the Health Board for the disabled, the disabled are "People who have difficulties in adapting to social life and meeting their daily needs because they lost their physical, mental, spiritual, emotional and social skills when they were born or later during their lifetime and needs protection, care or rehabilitation, counseling and support services at various levels” (Resmi Gazette, 2013). Disability, also referred to as orthopedic disability, is defined as a state of physical disability that partially or completely hinders the physical activity of a person by virtue of any disorder or lack of physical presence in the human structure (Seyyar, 2006: 337).

The history of social policies for the disadvantaged groups in Turkey are traced back to the Ottoman Empire period. The Ottoman State carried out services for the poor, widows, orphans, and disabled through traditional institutions (such as foundations, charities). After the establishment of the Republic, the 1924 Geneva Declaration on the Rights of the Child, which was the first document to cover disabled children and to include children with disabilities, was the first step in the era. In 1963, the General Directorate of Social Services was established by Law No. 225. The Agency carried out its duties until the establishment of the Social Services and Child Protection Agency Law and Social Services and Child Protection Agency General Directorate dated 24.05.1983 and numbered 2828. With the Law No. 2022 issued in 1976, it was made possible for some elderly and disabled citizens to receive financial social assistance (ASPB 2013-2017 Strategic Plan, 2012).

Disability arrangements have gained momentum since 1980. In 1981, the National Coordination Committee for the Protection of Disabled Persons was established in order to ensure the coordination and monitoring of services for the disabled. On December 3, 1996, the Authorization Code No. 4216 was adopted. The National Coordination Council for the Protection of Disabled Persons was closed on the basis of this authorization and the Office for the Administration of Disabled People under the Prime Ministry was established. On July 7, 2005, Law No. 5378 on Disabled People was implemented. This law was the first disability law and related legislation of Republican history. The Ministry of Family and Social Policy was later established by the Decree Law No. 633 dated 03.06.2011 (ASPB 2013-2017 Strategic Plan, 2012). With the amendment of the Law No. 5378 dated 07.07.2005 on 06.02.2014, the concept "disabled" was used in order to provide harmony and harmony against the disabled, handicapped and crippled concepts generally used by the authors due to the fact that this law is referred to as the Law on the disabled.

Other individuals in the society can participate in social life, find a job and work compared to individuals who are partially or completely disabled, the groups that these people create are called the disabled or disability groups (Özgökçeler, 2011: 265). According to Özgökçeler (2011: 280), policies towards disabled groups are affected by interrelated factors. Theses are listed as;
Family-oriented disability policy

Active employment policy for disabled individual

Private social housing for the disabled

Vocational rehabilitation and training of the disabled

Social security of disabled groups

Psycho-social and spiritual rehabilitation and adaptation focus on social life participation of disabled people

Accessibility of disabled people.

In December 2002 the Prime Minister of Turkey Statistical Institute and the Disability Administration cooperation, "Turkey Disability Survey 2002" was carried out with the aim of addressing lack of information and data on people with disabilities in Turkey. In these study, the number of people with disabilities in Turkey, the rate of socio-economic structure, expectations, the cause of disability, regional differences and the rate of having chronic disease were measured. According to the research findings, 12.29% constituted of the total disabled population (Turkey Disability Survey, 2002: 5). This ratio represents approximately 8.4 million disabled individuals (Özgökçeler, 2011: 271).

Within the scope of the "Law on the Monthly Bonding of 65 year old Persons in need, weak and untrained Turkish citizens" numbered 2022, under the scope of economic disability, commonly known as "disability pensions": Disabled persons aged 18 and older, and Turkish citizens who have disabled relatives who are under 18 years of age are legally obliged to look after them (Official Gazette, 1976).

In 2010, using education, health, working life, social services, etc. of disabled people as main indicators in the field, with the aim of identifying their problems and expectations in their daily lives the Problems and Expectations of the Disabled Persons research was conducted. According to research findings, 38.4% of disabled persons registered in the National Disability Database regularly benefit from social assistance. From this group; 27.2% regularly benefit from the disability pension, 11.2% from in-kind and in cash benefits of the General Directorate of Social Assistance and Solidarity, and 6.3% regularly benefit from in-kind and in cash benefits from Social Services Child Protection Agency (Özürlülerin Sorun ve Beklentileri Araştırması, 2010: 1-50).

Table 1. Pensions Between 2010-2017

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pension Type</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Disabled People Over The Age of 18 (40-69%) Pension</td>
<td>185.34 TL (3 Months, 556.02 TL)</td>
<td>291, 62 TL (3 Months, 874.86 TL)</td>
<td>353, 21 TL (3 Months, 1059.64 TL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Persons With Disabilities in Need of Care (70% and above) Pension</td>
<td>278.02 TL (3 Months, 834.06 TL)</td>
<td>437, 43 TL (3 Months, 1312.29 TL)</td>
<td>529, 82 TL (3 Months, 1589.47 TL)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disabled Relative Below The Age of 18 Pension</td>
<td>185.34 TL (3 Months, 556.02 TL)</td>
<td>291, 62 TL (3 Months, 874.86 TL)</td>
<td>353, 21 TL (3 Months, 1059.64 TL)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Compiled from the Ministry of Family and Social Policy.
The results indicate that the disabled pensions paid according to Law No. 2022 amount to 556.02 TL for 3 months for the disabled over the age of 18 (With a disability rate of 40-69%) in 2010 and the salary was 874.86 TL in 2015. For disabled people in need of care (with a disability rate of 70% or more), in 2010 the 3-month disabled salary payments were 834.06 TL. It was indicated that in 2015 this salary was 1312.29 TL. While the monthly amount paid for disabled relative below the age of 18 in the year 2010 was TL 556.02 for 3 months, the amount paid was recorded as TL 874.86 for 3 months in 2015. The pensions for the year 2017 was 1059.64 TL for 3 month, for people with disabilities over 18 years old (40-69% disability), 1589.47 TL for 3 months for disabled people in need of care (70% disability rate) and the monthly amount paid for disabled relative below the age of 18 was TL 1059.64 for three months.

85.7% of persons with disabilities registered in the National Disability Database emphasized that they expect public institutions and organizations to increase social assistance and support, 77% to improve health services, 40.4% to improve and disseminate care services, 28.7% to increase employment opportunities, 25.6% to increase educational opportunities (TÜİK, Özürlülerin Sorun ve Beklentileri Araştırması, 2010: 1-50).

Table 2. Social Protection Expenditures, % 2014, 2015. (Million TL)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Protection Expenditures</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Expenditure</td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Protection Expenditure Total</td>
<td>247 244</td>
<td>100,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>9 251</td>
<td>3,7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data compiled from Statistical Institute of Turkey 2016

According to the 2014 Turkey Statistical Institute data on social protection, expenditure was recorded as 247 billion 244 million. By the year 2015, the total expenditure was 279 billion 734 million. In the context of social protection expenditures, the disability-assistance payments in 2014 accounted for 3.7% of all benefits and this rate was 3.6% in 2015. Even though there was a slight decrease in proportion, social protection assistance of 9 billion 251 million for the disabled in 2014 became 10 billion 203 million in 2015.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Protection Expenditures</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>In-Kind Benefits</td>
<td>Cash Benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Protection Expenditure Total</td>
<td>84 044</td>
<td>158 868</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>4 720</td>
<td>4 531</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data compiled from Statistical Institute of Turkey 2016

According to the Turkey Statistical Institute, data for the year 2014 indicates that 84.044 million of in-kind assistance, and 158 billion 868 million of cash assistance was recorded. Of the 279 billion 734 million social protection expenditures made in 2015, administrative expenses and other expenditures (4 billion 873 million) were deducted, 92 billion 768 million were provided as the in-kind benefits and 182 billion 94 million were provided as cash assistance. In 2014, of 9 billion 251 million of disability oriented social protection aid, 4 billion 531 million were provided in cash benefits and 4 billion 720 million were provided in-kind benefits. In 2015, 10 billion 203 million social assistance benefits was paid to the disabled, 5 billion 35 million were part of the cash aid, 5 billion 168 million were part of the in-kind benefits.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Protection Expenditures</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conditional Benefits</td>
<td>Unconditional Benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Protection Expenditure Total</td>
<td>23 250</td>
<td>219 662</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>7 203</td>
<td>2 048</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Data compiled from Statistical Institute of Turkey 2016

When examining conditional and unconditional benefits, in 2014, from the 244 billion 244 million, when social protection expenditures, administrative expenses and other expenditures were deducted, 23 billion 250 million was part of conditional benefits and 219 billion 662 million was part of unconditioned benefits. When administrative expenses and other expenditures from 279 billion 734 million social protection expenditures provided in 2015 were deducted, 25 billion 409 million of conditional benefits and 249 billion 453 million of unconditional benefits were provided. In 2014, 9 billion 251 million of social protection aid provided for the disabled, 7 billion 203 million constituted conditional benefits and 2 billion 48 million constituted unconditional benefits. In 2015, of the 10 billion 203 million provided for social protection, 7 billion 827 million parts of social protection aid constitutes conditional benefits and 2 billion 377 million constitutes of unconditional benefits.


<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Proportion of Social Protection Expenditures to GDP</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Social Protection Expenditure Total</td>
<td>12,1</td>
<td>12,0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>0,5</td>
<td>0,4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Data compiled from Statistical Institute of Turkey 2016

It is indicated that the share of social protection expenditures in the gross domestic product (GDP) was 12.1% in 2014. In 2015, the share of social protection expenditures in GDP was 12%. The share of social protection expenditures allocated to the disability in GDP was 0.5% in 2014 and 0.4% in 2015.

Table 6. Number of Social Protection Receivers. (In thousand people)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Protection Expenditures</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Total</td>
<td>Male</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Number of Persons Receiving Salary</td>
<td>12 009</td>
<td>7 004</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>806</td>
<td>500</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Source:** Data compiled from Statistical Institute of Turkey 2016
It is observed that the number of people receiving salary (retirement / elderly, widow / orphan and disability salary) under social protection was 12 million 9 thousand in 2014. This number increased by 4.1% in 2015 to 12 million 498 thousand people. According to the data, there are 806 thousand persons who received the disabled salary in 2014. Of these 806 thousand persons, 500 thousand comprised of male individuals who receive disability wages and 306 thousand were women. There was a total of 831 thousand people who received a disability pension in 2015. Of these 831 thousand persons, 508 thousand comprised of male individuals who receive disability pensions, and 324 thousand of them were women.

Table 7. Social Protection, Conditional and Unconditional Benefits, 2014,2015 (In thousand people)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Social Protection Expenditures</th>
<th>2014</th>
<th>2015</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Conditional Benefits</td>
<td>Unconditional Benefits</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disability</td>
<td>678</td>
<td>128</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Data compiled from Statistical Institute of Turkey 2016

According to the Turkey Statistical Institute data, from a total of 806 thousand persons with disability receiving salary under social protection, 128 thousand received unconditional disability pension, while 678 thousand composed of individuals receiving conditional disability pension. There was a total of 831 thousand people who received a disability pension in 2015. 131 thousand of the total salary areas comprised of unconditional disability salary, and 700 thousand comprised of conditional disability salary.

Discussion and Conclusion

When considering the history of the concept of the social state and social policy in Turkey, it emerged through the state and after manifested with some regulations and practices in 1980. The disabled individual can be able to challenge the existence of all aspects of life if the difficulties encountered in rescuing their life are removed. The social state is at this point a contributing part of this struggle for disabled people by producing social policies. In summary, social policies aim at eliminating inequalities with the understanding of social justice for their citizens, protecting the disadvantaged groups in the society and creating the minimum conditions for these groups. The welfare state is one of the fundamental characteristics of the Republic of Turkey clearly stated in the constitution. Organizations affiliated to the Ministry of Family and Social Policies in Turkey carry out most of the social assistance.

Within the scope of social assistance, firstly 2010-2015 and 2017 disabled pensions were examined. There appears to be an approximately half-to-half difference between the pensions already paid (in 2017) and the pensions paid in 2010. According to the findings of the Problems and Expectations Survey of Disabled People in 2010, it can be said that this situation is a positive development when it is thought that the vast majority of the disabled people are expecting an increase in social benefits.

When the social protection expenditures made in 2014-2015 are examined, it can be seen that the expenditures made for the disability decrease proportionally in all expenditures in 2015, but there is an increase in the expenditure amount. When the social protection expenditures are treated as the in-kind and as cash aid, it is seen that the amount of aid provide in both years is relatively close to each other. According to the data, most of these benefits are provided under conditional benefits. The share of social protection expenditures in gross domestic product (GDP) was around 12% every two years. However, very little of these expenditures are made for the disabled.
According to the findings of the 2002 Disability Survey, it is important to note that the benefits for the 8.4 million disabled population in those years can not be ignored. In a country where the disabled population is so dense, according to the Turkey Statistical Institute data in the year 2014-2015 it shows that the number of individuals receiving salary is not even 1 million. In this case, it is clear that the ability to participate in life at a normal human level is sufficient to discuss the adequacy of expenditures made for disabled people to such a degree by such assistance.

References


Law No. 2022 on the Connection of Monthly to the Citizens who are 65 Years Old and Completely in Need, Weak and Homeless, Acceptance Date: 01.07.1976, Official Gazette Date: 10.07.1976, Number: 15642.


Regulation on the Reports of the Health Board to be given to Disability Criterion, Classification and Disability, Official Gazette Date: 30.03.2013, Number: 28603.


Seyyar, A., (2008), Social Political Terms. 2. Printing, Sakarya, Sakarya Publishing


Soysal, M., (1986), 100 Meaning of the Constitutional Constitution, İstanbul, Gerçek Publisher.


